



*Sustainable Tourism Network Southern Africa*

*Reseau du Tourisme Durable dans l'Afrique Austral*

*Rede do Turismo Sustentável da África Austral*

# **Sustainable Tourism Network Southern Africa (STNSA)**

## **Annual General Meeting 2010**

**Thursday, 6 May 2010**

**Inkosi Albert Luthuli International Convention Centre,  
Durban, South Africa**

## **Meeting Report**

All presentations have been uploaded to the Sustainable Tourism Network of Southern Africa (STNSA) website: <http://www.sustainabletourismnetwork.co.za/resources/agms/>

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Sustainable Tourism Network Southern Africa (STNSA) Annual Meeting 2010 was held on May 6<sup>th</sup> at the Inkosi Albert Luthuli International Convention Centre in Durban. The meeting was attended by 41 delegates from nine SADC countries. Attendance included representatives from sustainable tourism certification programmes, NGOs, local and national government representatives and other sustainable tourism stakeholders from Botswana, Lesotho, Madagascar, Mauritius, Mozambique, Namibia, South Africa, Tanzania and Zimbabwe. Regionally focused organisations were also represented, namely: Africa World Heritage Fund, Boundless Southern Africa, Open Africa, SNV Tanzania and Southern Africa Trust (SAT).

The meeting was made possible by funding from SAT and was organised and facilitated by the STNSA Secretariat, Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa (FTTSA).

The objectives of the meetings were to:

1. Reach consensus on the need to increase co-operation on sustainable tourism issues throughout SADC and /or throughout Africa.
2. Provide delegates with an improved understanding of business practices that contribute to poverty eradication effectively.
3. Provide delegates with an improved understanding of how to utilise value and supply chains to increase local economic development and the pro-poor impact of tourism expenditure.
4. To finalise plans to produce a business plan for the STNSA.

Presentations were given by representatives of the STNSA Secretariat regarding Network progress and related international developments and activities, while other experts provided presentations about sustainable tourism development in Africa with a poverty eradication focus. The full list of presentations made during the workshop is as follows:

1. Network Developments: May 2009 to May 2010 (Kate Finlay – Network Secretariat)
2. Outcomes of the Tourism Sustainability Council's Africa Workshop: *Accrediting Sustainable Tourism Certification – Africa, January 2010* (Jennifer Seif – Network Secretariat)
3. Increasing the Local Economic Impact of Tourism through Supply and Value Chains (Anna Spenceley – Spenceley Tourism and Development)
4. Value Chain Development as a Destination Management Tool - The Zanzibar Example (Birgit Steck – SNV Tanzania)

1

***This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).***

5. B4D – Business for Development Pathfinder (Ulrich Klins - SAT)
6. *Strengthening the Network* (Jennifer Seif – STNSA Secretariat)<sup>1</sup>

Delegates were very supportive of the work being done by the STNSA at present and there was a general feeling that the Network should continue to grow in numbers and influence. Suggestions and opinions revolved around the following main themes:

- That the Network should continue to be inclusive of African countries as a whole and not just SADC countries.
- That the Network should continue to create and / or maintain relationships with local and national government and with regionally-focused organisations such as the Regional Tourism Organisation of Southern Africa (RETOSA).
- That the Network can provide a unified voice on sustainable tourism issues regionally and internationally. For example we can participate in the piloting of the Tourism Sustainability Council's (TSC) accreditation of sustainable tourism certification programmes and the Network provides a platform for collective input on TSC proposed processes.
- That the Network needs to develop a business plan in order to decide how best to move forward with the structure of the organisation, e.g. perhaps a more formalised network as opposed to the fairly informal structure that we have at present. The structure should speak to the goals and objectives of the Network.
- That the Network needs to develop a business plan which should specify ways in which members can aid the Secretariat and how the Secretariat could be strengthened.

The presentations on value and supply chains and pro-poor business were very well received by delegates.

A number of first-time STNSA participants provided positive feedback on the meeting. Among other comments they said that the meeting enabled them to understand what is being done in SADC / Africa regarding sustainable tourism development and that it allowed for the facilitation of many networking opportunities.

---

<sup>1</sup> A final presentation on the STNSA work plan 2010-2011 was prepared but not presented due to time constraints and is available at <http://www.sustainabletourismnetwork.co.za/resources/agms/>

***This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).***

**TABLE OF CONTENTS:**

Meeting Report .....	0
1. IN ATTENDANCE .....	4
2. MEETING ORGANISATION AND OBJECTIVES .....	5
3. OPENING REMARKS .....	6
4. PRESENTATION ONE .....	6
Network Developments: May 2009 to May 2010 .....	6
5. PRESENTATION TWO .....	7
Outcomes of the Tourism Sustainability Council’s Africa Workshop: <i>Accrediting Sustainable Tourism Certification – Africa, January 2010</i> .....	7
6. PRESENTATION THREE .....	9
Increasing the Local Economic Impact of Tourism through Supply and Value Chains .....	9
7. PRESENTATION FOUR .....	10
Value Chain Development as a Destination Management Tool – The Zanzibar Example - .....	10
8. PRESENTATION FIVE .....	11
B 4 D – Business for Development Pathfinder .....	11
Strengthening the Network .....	13
9. CLOSURE .....	16

*This event was made possible by the generous support of the  
Southern Africa Trust (SAT).*

Thursday, 6 May 2010

Meeting facilitator: Lisa Scriven (STNSA Secretariat)

## 1. IN ATTENDANCE

41 sustainable tourism stakeholders from 9 southern African countries attended the Sustainable Tourism Network Southern Africa (STNSA) Annual Meeting.

Organisation	Country based in
Botswana Tourism Board	Botswana
Quthing Wildlife Development Trust	Lesotho
Go To Madagascar	Madagascar
Madagascar National Tourism Board	Madagascar
Executive Corporate and Leisure Services	Mauritius
Go To Madagascar	Madagascar
Direccao Nacional de Turismo	Mozambique
Eco-awards Namibia	Namibia
ComMark	Namibia
Amamboma	South Africa
Department of Trade and Industry	South Africa
Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa	South Africa
Gariiep Tourism	South Africa
Gauteng Tourism	South Africa
International Centre for Responsible Tourism South Africa	South Africa
Local Enterprise Authority	South Africa
South African National Parks	South Africa
Malandy Consulting	South Africa

4

*This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).*

Motheo District Municipality	South Africa
National Department of Tourism	South Africa
National Off-Road Workgroup	South Africa
Tourism Empowerment Council of South Africa	South Africa
Urban-Econ Tourism	South Africa
Tourism Board	Tanzania
Zanzibar Institute of Tourism Development	Tanzania
Council of Tourism	Zimbabwe
<b>Regional Organizations Represented:</b>	
Africa World Heritage Fund	
Boundless Southern Africa	
SNV Tanzania	
Southern Africa Trust	

## 2. MEETING ORGANISATION AND OBJECTIVES

The meeting was organised and facilitated by the STNSA Secretariat, Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa (FTTSA) and was made possible by funding provided by the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).

The objectives of the meeting were to:

1. Reach consensus on the need to increase co-operation on sustainable tourism issues throughout SADC and /or throughout Africa.
2. Provide delegates with an improved understanding of business practices that contribute to poverty eradication effectively.
3. Provide delegates with an improved understanding of how to utilise value and supply chains to increase local economic development and the pro-poor impact of tourism expenditure.
4. To finalise plans to produce a business plan for the STNSA.

### 3. OPENING REMARKS

On behalf of the Network Secretariat, Lisa Scriven welcomed everyone to the STNSA Annual General Meeting 2010. In order to facilitate discussion and good networking opportunities, everyone in attendance was requested to introduce themselves and indicate the organisation they were representing.

The meeting objectives were also reviewed and agreed upon.

### 4. PRESENTATION ONE

#### **Network Developments: May 2009 to May 2010**

Kate Finlay (STNSA Secretariat)

Kate presented on the background of the Network (i.e. since its inception at the end of 2007) as well as progress made during the year under review, namely May 2009 to May 2010.

- A new STNSA website was developed in the last year. The new site contains extensive information on sustainable tourism: e.g. case studies, certification programmes, awards, homepage posts of relevant newsworthy stories, country policy pages and sustainable tourism information for tourists. Tourism products that meet certain criteria can register their information for the links page and / or for the sustainable tourism tourist page free of charge. There is a Global Sustainable Tourism Criteria (GSTC) self-assessment quiz as well as a forum where relevant topics can be discussed.
- There have been six STNSA newsletters to date and a 489% increase in newsletter subscribers over the last year (436 newsletter subscribers in April 2010 compared to 74 in April 2009).
- New STNSA collateral (updated brochures, t-shirts) and four ribbon advertisements in the 2010 Indaba Daily News.
- Memorandum of understanding (MoU) between STNSA and RETOSA that aims to support the mandate of both parties, facilitate information sharing and networking opportunities and create opportunities for joint programming.
- STNSA facilitated an Africa consultation meeting in Johannesburg on behalf of the Tourism Sustainability Council (TSC) in January 2010. The purpose

6

*This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).*

of this meeting was to discuss the TSC's international accreditation system for sustainable tourism certification programmes. The meeting was attended by 9 certification programmes from the following countries: Botswana, Kenya, Namibia, Morocco and South Africa. Also in attendance were two representatives from developing sustainable tourism certification programmes in Mauritius and Madagascar.

- A special edition of *Development Southern Africa* is in press, focusing on sustainable tourism. Jennifer Seif (FTTSA Executive Director) is a guest editor along with Kate Rivett-Carnac (Tourism Specialist, Development Bank of Southern Africa). The special edition of this internationally accredited journal will be published in December 2010.

#### **Discussion Points**

Q: What is the MoU with RETOSA about?

A: RETOSA approached the Secretariat at the beginning of the year indicating that it would like a closer working relationship with STNSA. The outcome was a MoU to create a platform for collaboration. The MoU is a statement of intent. STNSA must now decide the details of how it wishes to work with RETOSA.

## **5. PRESENTATION TWO**

### **Outcomes of the Tourism Sustainability Council's Africa Workshop: Accrediting Sustainable Tourism Certification – Africa, January 2010**

Jennifer Seif (STNSA Secretariat)

- Jennifer firstly discussed the purpose of the TSC's Africa Workshop, which was a roundtable meeting for African certification programmes to discuss alignment to the Global Sustainable Tourism Criteria (GSTC) and provide input to the TSC's proposed international accreditation programme for sustainable tourism certificates. Similar meetings took place in Latin America, North America, Europe and Asia-Pacific.
- The workshop took place in Johannesburg in January 2010 and was funded by UNEP with additional support by the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).
- Nine sustainable tourism certification programmes participated in the consultative meeting and were able to provide input on the TSCs proposed

7

*This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).*

accreditation programme and the GSTC; at the same time, the meeting afforded the TSC an improved understanding of the context of sustainable tourism in Africa, the role of national certification programmes and the potential impacts of the TSC's proposed accreditation standards.

- Certification organisations represented at the Johannesburg meeting raised a number of concerns about the TSC process, including (among other issues) the potential undermining of national accreditation schemes, requisite further clarification of the GSTC and the affordability of accreditation fees. It was agreed that African stakeholders would engage collectively with the TSC, providing input via the STNSA Secretariat, in order to ensure that such concerns are addressed sufficiently.
- STNSA members will be invited along with other sustainable tourism networks and stakeholders, to participate in regular reviews of the GSTC (a 36 month cyclical review process). The next review will be in November 2010.
- STNSA members will also be invited to comment on the TSC accreditation system. A draft accreditation manual has just been released for comment and the proposed accreditation process will be piloted in the near future. Certification organisations in Africa in particular need to engage with these processes. STNSA should lobby the TSC to ensure that one of the planned pilots takes place in Africa.
- STNSA enables sustainable tourism stakeholders in SADC, and more loosely in Africa, to speak with one voice and so engage directly with the international TSC process in a more coordinated and effective manner. The TSC Africa meeting was testimony to how powerful the Network can be and therefore the Network is now the port of call for such communication and processes.
- STNSA should lobby TSC for representation on the TSC board (to be formed shortly).

#### **Discussion Points**

- The Network should remain inclusive and open to participation by stakeholders from throughout Africa.
- STNSA should get in contact with the Forestry Stewardship Council (FSC) about lessons learned during the FSC start-up period. This will enable

STNSA members to monitor the extent to which the TSC is incorporating best practice and to lobby accordingly.

- STNSA should enlist RETOSA to lobby the TSC process.
- A member of the TSC interim advisory board was present in the meeting and communicated that the TSC is still in development and all comments are welcome. The Secretariat may distribute the draft accreditation manual when it is made available and coordinate comments by STNSA members for submission to the TSC.
- The launch of the TSC is delayed. TSC membership will open in June-July 2010. The meeting requested further clarification of membership criteria and fees and reiterated the view that TSC membership should not compete with certification services offered in Africa.
- The process for nominating/electing the new TSC board is not clear. The Secretariat should follow up with TSC to determine how this process will work and to lobby for African representation on the board.

Delegates were polled by show of hands to confirm how STNSA should engage with the TSC in the next six months:

- Would we like to engage with the draft accreditation manual? *Yes.*
- Would we like to lobby for representation on the board? *Yes.*
- Should we build stronger ties with other networks e.g. Network of the Americas? *Yes. However, we should also ensure that we are sharing information amongst ourselves as a precondition of external networking.*
- Should we use RETOSA to ensure that the TSC talks to national governments in Africa? *Yes.*
- Should we participate in the regular reviews of the GSTC? *Yes. Government representatives should also be involved and report back to their respective countries.*

## 6. PRESENTATION THREE

### **Increasing the Local Economic Impact of Tourism through Supply and Value Chains**

Anna Spenceley (Spenceley Tourism and Development cc)

- A tourism supply chain was defined as a system of organisations (e.g. people, technology, activities, information and resources) involved in moving a product or service from supplier to customer.

- The objective of intervening in the tourism supply chain is to enhance the pro-poor impacts of tourism growth and development for example by removing barriers to entry for poor people; improving labour standards; and improving knock-on effects that tourism operations have on surrounding communities. Examples of supply chain interventions include investigating use of new suppliers, stimulating change amongst existing suppliers, shortening the supply chain by removing the middle man, and so forth.
- A value chain is defined as the process whereby products pass through different activities before they are 'sold'. The chain of activities gives the products more value (added value) compared to the sum of the value of each component. From a pro-poor tourism perspective, the objective is to increase the amount and proportion of money that is earned locally. A nine step value chain analysis and development approach has been developed (refer to presentation saved on STNSA website).
- Examples of value chain interventions are: to sell at a greater volume, to create better coordination and communication within, and between stakeholders (e.g. artisans, farmers) and to diversify markets (sales locally, nationally and export).

#### **Discussion Points**

- The presentation was very well received and delegates expressed a need for further information including case studies and examples of pro poor tourism tools / guidelines. The following links were provided:  
Overseas Development Institute: [www.odi.org.uk](http://www.odi.org.uk)  
Pro Poor Tourism Partnership: [www.propoortourism.org.uk](http://www.propoortourism.org.uk)

## **7. PRESENTATION FOUR**

### **Value Chain Development as a Destination Management Tool – The Zanzibar Example -**

Birgit Steck (SNV Tanzania)

- Birgit presented the findings of a research study that aimed to measure the financial flows from the tourism industry accruing to 'the poor' in Zanzibar and to suggest and prioritise interventions based on this analysis.

- The research identified where tourism revenue is flowing throughout the Zanzibari tourism industry; measured the direct financial impacts on ‘the poor’ who were defined prior to the research; analysed the barriers for ‘the poor’ to earning tourism revenue; and suggested interventions based on the financial and logistical analysis.
- The Value Chain Analysis undertaken examined the pro-poor impact of expenditure in the accommodation, the food and beverage, craft and transportation supply chains and also excursion sectors. The findings of this analysis enabled SNV to formulate and prioritise specific interventions, in dialogue with Zanzibari stakeholders (recommendations were validated by the stakeholders).
- The direct intervention areas identified were: 1) employment; 2) linkages to local economies; and 3) SMME development.
- The full presentation is available on the STNSA website at <http://www.sustainabletourismnetwork.co.za/resources/agms/>. This very detailed presentation includes facts, figures and specific interventions of the case study in Zanzibar. .

#### **Discussion Points**

- One delegate commented that in her experience, South African “locals” tend to see themselves as employees and not tourism drivers. She wanted to know if this was the same in Zanzibar and how we can start to develop more community owned / based tourism enterprises.
- Response – empowering communities and skills development is a long term goal. One must remember that there are many ways the community can get involved in tourism (e.g. supply chains) and not just through ownership of tourism assets.
- Go to Madagascar pointed out that different environments / contexts call for different poverty reduction strategies.

## **8. PRESENTATION FIVE**

### **B 4 D – Business for Development Pathfinder**

Ulrich Klins (Southern Africa Trust)

- B4D Pathfinder is a project that is representative of inclusive business ideals. Inclusive business aims to overcome poverty by incorporating low income communities into a company's value chain while maintaining

11

*This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).*

profitability and upholding the principles of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).

- In sum, B4D looks at how business practices can be adapted to achieve long-term commercial profit and deliver greater benefits to the poor.
- The inclusive business / B4D approach conveys various benefits to the private sector, government and the local community.
- Africa's tourism industry is comprised mainly of small and medium sized enterprises often lacking financial and human resources. The diverse range of actors involved in tourism is also a factor i.e. no model solution to poverty reduction in tourism.
- Case studies of inclusive business were presented including the example of Coca Cola in Ethiopia and Tanzania where the company has introduced manual distribution centres. In Ethiopia 75% of new employees were recruited without any prior work experience; while in Tanzania this was 33% of new recruits. Overall, the Coca Cola initiative created about 12 000 new jobs.
- The B4D programme has published a self assessment barometer for companies, which may be used by tourism enterprises. Information was distributed to delegates and is also available on the STNSA website at <http://www.sustainabletourismnetwork.co.za/resources/agms/>.

#### **Discussion Points**

- It was noted that the B4D programme and tools mainly target big companies. However the extensive literature on pro-poor tourism provides many examples of effective interventions by small and medium sized enterprises.
- FTTSA noted that poverty reduction may conflict with other agendas. In South Africa for example Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment (BBBEE) is not necessarily "pro-poor" and enterprise development initiatives do not automatically create employment let alone decent work. These sorts of conflicting situations and agendas need to be resolved.
- Botswana Tourism agreed that the situation in Botswana was very similar.
- Gauteng Tourism thought that the B4D approach might not have a trickle down effect in reality.
- It was suggested that B4D criteria could be incorporated into certification criteria and programmes.

12

*This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).*

- African Safari Lodge stressed the need to place poor people at the centre of the business process. What requires attention is how to make community groups sustainable (e.g. certification, training, understanding agreements and contracts, etc.).
- SNV – communities need to be informed and understand their rights when talking about inclusive business – particularly around issues of human rights and labour standards.
- Local enterprise authority in Botswana – have included large businesses into their portfolio. These businesses have been included in value chain meetings. This aids in shifting the idea away from corporate social responsibility (CSR) to sustainable business practices. They sell it to the businesses as being useful for their profit line thus eliminating unnecessary negative perceptions about CSR. Government is an important facilitator in this process.
- SANParks – we are preaching to the ‘converted’ and many of those who can effect change are not present at the meeting. Businesses are interested in profit and greed. Perhaps certification should be mandatory?

## 9. PRESENTATION SIX

### **Strengthening the Network**

Jennifer Seif (STNSA Secretariat)

The Secretariat requested delegates to reflect on the focus and structure of STNSA. A short plenary discussion was followed by group works (four groups) to discuss this question. Feedback by groups is summarised below.

#### **A. Broad vision for STNSA**

While some delegates were of the view that the Network should focus specifically on sustainable tourism certification, the majority felt that the focus should be on facilitating a coordinated approach to sustainable tourism in general. This approach would include but not be limited to certification as a policy and business development instrument.

It was also suggested that the Network should focus on bringing in the private sector in a more focused way.

The majority of delegates suggested that the Network remain inclusive and further expand to the whole of Africa instead of just southern Africa. Leading on

13

*This event was made possible by the generous support of the Southern Africa Trust (SAT).*

from this point, it was suggested that the Network could play a key role in harmonising certification standards across Africa.

***B. Focus areas: Are they still relevant? Should they be ranked in order of priority?***

***The four focus areas identified in 2007 are:***

1. Policy and advocacy
  2. Standards and branding
  3. Training and learning
  4. Marketing and awareness-raising
- The general feeling was that the four thematic focus areas remain relevant.
  - Delegates differed in their opinions of which focus area should come first: some thought certification / standards and branding should be the first priority while others thought that advocacy was the most important.
  - It was also agreed that advocacy should be carried out nationally and internationally.
  - Some delegates were of the view that training and learning is a tool rather than a focus area and therefore should be removed from the list.
  - Here again, the view was reiterated that the Network must find ways to target the private sector.

***C. 3 key actions for each focus area that could be achieved in the next 3 months***

- Country-level meetings could be convened.
- A list of all members and their contact details published on the STNSA website.
- The Network should piggy back on other initiatives as much as possible.
- The Network should comment on the draft TSC Manual.
- Certification programmes should apply to be the pilot project for the TSC accreditation process.

***D. 3 key actions for each focus areas that could be achieved in 12 months***

- Emphasise and formalise link to TSC
- All members should provide comments on the TSC draft accreditation manual once it is released.
- Dialogue with RETOSA
- Dialogue with national government
- Dialogue on draft standards (GSTC) every 36 months (i.e. as they come up for review) – next opportunity to input is November 2010
- Clearer definition of the Network membership
- Business plan for the Network and report back on this plan. Look at organisational options, funding implications. Activities should not overlap with existing initiatives. Rather partner with other organisations than undermine them.
- Country symposiums
- Sustainable Tourism Conference is happening in Nelspruit in from 15-19 November 2010 – STNSA could participate
- Educational awareness programme for tourists and the private sector
- Policy and advocacy: Network should do a baseline study on country sustainable tourism policies. Compare and analyse. Examples can enable a more integrated approach.

***E. 3 key actions for each focus area that could be achieved in 3 years***

- Create a more formal network
- Joint projects e.g. between member countries, member organisations and/or for the entire network membership.
- The Network should interact to a greater extent with government regarding policies for sustainable tourism.
- Try to involve global media as much as possible e.g. Go to Madagascar film which will be released in 2010. This is an opportune time to focus on media links as the global media are concentrating on Africa in 2010.
- If tourism businesses are drawn into the STNSA they could possibly form a business association.

General discussion:

Facilitated by Jennifer Seif (STNSA Secretariat)

The following general points were made by the floor:

- FTTSA should remain as the Secretariat and should approach more donors to raise funds to keep STNSA going. The Secretariat could be expended/strengthened through country representatives.

- We need to compile training tools that exist already without reinventing the wheel.
- The point was also raised that if we have a more broadly defined network (e.g. beyond certification) we may risk losing funding from donors because we would not be able to define our mandate / focus / activities very specifically. We should not spread ourselves too thin.
- At the same time, a too narrow focus on certification would ultimately exclude large numbers of potential participants. The challenge is to balance competing needs and expectations (alongside available resources), which may see STNSA focusing on particular issues at particular moments in time.
- All of the above will be considered within the development of the business plan.

(Further notes can be viewed on the 'STNSA – quo vidas?' presentation on the STNSA website: [www.sustainabletourismnetwork.co.za](http://www.sustainabletourismnetwork.co.za))

## 9. CLOSURE

Lisa Scriven (STNSA Secretariat)

Lisa conveyed a general note of thanks to all for attendance and active participation. She also thanked the SAT for making the meeting possible.

Teboho Mokau (Quthing Wildlife Development Trust)

Teboho expressed thanks as a long-standing participant in the Network. He thanked the organisers and SAT for making the AGM a success. He encouraged all to attend next year.

Jennifer Seif (Network Secretariat)

Jennifer conveyed a note of thanks to Kate Finlay (Network Coordinator) and other members of the Secretariat for a well organised and productive meeting.